

Recenziji • Reviews

Ankica Petrović

Umetnost petja gange: kulturna tradicija dinarskega območja

Ankica Petrović. *Umetnost pjevanja gange: kulturna tradicija Dinarske zone* [Umetnost petja gange: kulturna tradicija dinarskega območja]. Livno, Zagreb in Sarajevo: Franjevački muzej in galerija Gorica in Synopsis, 2018. 288 strani + CD-ROM. 23 €. ISBN: 978-9958-01-060-6 (Synopsis, Sarajevo) 978-953-7968-54-0 (Synopsis, Zagreb) 978-9926-8173-1-2 (Franjevački muzej in galerija Gorica).

Ganga je trenutno najbolj priljubljena zvrst tradicionalnega petja na območju Dinarskega gorovja, ki se razteza preko Hrvaške in Bosne in Hercegovine. To je eden izmed zadnjih primerov arhaičnega sloga ustvarjanja glasbe, ki je povsem drugačen od drugih tradicionalnih slogov petja, kakršen je npr. petje »klapa«, ki temelji na tradicijah glasbe Zahodne Evrope. Ta slog tradicionalnega ustvarjanja glasbe še danes – tako kot nekdaj – predstavlja pomembno prepoznavno značilnost dinarskih skupnosti v Jugovzhodni Evropi. Avtorica recenzirane knjige, sarajevska etnomuzikologinja Ankica Petrović, ostaja največja glasnica fenomena glasbe *ganga* v znanstvenih krogih zunaj nekdanje Jugoslavije.

Knjiga Ankice Petrović temelji na terenskih raziskavah, ki jih je izvajala v zgodnjih 1970-ih in na osnovi katerih je napisala doktorsko disertacijo, ki jo je zagovarjala leta 1977 na Kraljičini univerzi v Belfastu. To je bila celovita študija, ki je analizirala *gango* kot prevladujoči žanr v kontekstu drugih tradicionalnih glasbenih žanrov na območju Dinarskega gorovja – kot kulturno prakso, ki obenem odraža in kroji lokalne, regionalne, spolne in etnične identifikacije. Avtorica poudarja, da je bila že sama odločitev za temo precejšnja preizkušnja, saj se je pričakovalo, da bo izbrala nekoliko manj »primitivno« obliko glasbe, kot je *ganga*; tudi v tem oziru si je avtorica prizadevala za kritično soočenje s tovrstnimi pričakovanji družbe, v kateri je delovala (str. 13). Vpliv mentorja Johna Blackinga je razširil njene poglede na tradicionalno glasbo, še posebej glede kulturnih in antropoloških pristopov do »*gange* kot kulture«, vključno s celostnimi strukturnimi in performativnimi značilnostmi tega sloga. Takšno razmišljanje je bilo v jugoslovanski etnomuzikologiji 1970-ih let novo in še danes ostaja aktualno. Ankica Petrović je prav tako sprejela nov teoretsko-metodološki pristop, ki se ukvarja s pomenom in funkcijo glasbe v družbi, s koncepti in praksami t. i. »nosilcev tradicije«, dinamiko spola, etničnimi in regionalnimi identifikacijami ter z refleksijo glasbene prakse v dejanskem kontekstu njenega izvajanja, ne samo na odru, temveč tudi v vsakdanjem življenju.

Knjigo sestavlja pet obsežnih poglavij – »*Ganga* v času in družbi«, »Procesi preučevanja *gange*«, »Transkripcija glasbenih primerov«, »Analiza glasbenega sloga« in »Estetska obravnava *gange*« –, ki so umeščena med predgovor, uvod in zaključek. Knjigi je priložen tudi CD s petintridesetimi posnetki *gange* s terena. Posnetki so slabe kakovosti, saj so bili večkrat sinhronizirani in shranjeni na različnih neprimernih medijih, kot priznava Petrovičeva, ki pa na te dejavnike ni imela vpliva.

Avtoričina začetna premisa je, da osnovnih značilnosti strukture tradicionalnega petja in plesa oz. glasbenega sloga ni mogoče analizirati brez preučevanja socialnih in kulturnih odnosov, v katerih je ta glasba nastala. Njen vizionarski in še danes relevanten pionirski pristop je *gango* skupaj s sodobnimi žanri utemeljil kot pomemben dejavnik oblikovanja lokalnih glasbenih kultur, kulturno-antropološki pristop k etnomuzikološkimi raziskavam pa ostaja še dandanes veljaven. Kar njeni raziskavi manjka, je boljši uvid v sodobni raziskovalni kontekst, saj se je v desetletjih od nastanka raziskave dojemanje koncepta, glasbenega sloga in novih vlog *gange* v marsikaterem pogledu spremenilo. V tem oziru bi knjigi koristilo soočenje z delom drugih, bolj nedavnih študij na tem področju.¹

Ob opisovanju *gange* Petrovičeva opaza, da gre za glasbeni fenomen, ki izzove bodisi popolnoma navdušene ali izjemno odklonile reakcije: za urbane posameznike je *ganga* groba in neuravnovešena, blizu kričanju ali joku. Med mestnim prebivalstvom po avtoričinem mnenju prevladuje prepričanje, da je ta vrsta glasbe »primitivna« in da bi jo morale zamenjati bolj primerne glasbene oblike, kot npr. *bečarac*. Kljub takšnim mnenjem ostaja *ganga* avtentičen in prominenten glasbeni izraz, ki ohranja svoj delež v regionalnem glasbenem vokabularju, obenem pa si je utrl pot tudi v urbana okolja, kar utrjuje socialno komponento *gange* kot sredstva glasbene komunikacije med člani iste skupnosti, specifično pa med ruralnimi in urbanimi sloji družbe. *Ganga* se izvaja kot prostočasna glasbena dejavnost, pri čemer jo še zlasti mlade in srednje generacije izvajalcev *gange* v primerjavi z drugimi zvrstmi, kot so *bečarac*, sevdalinka in »petje na bas« (»*pjevanje na bas*«), pojmujejo kot najlepšo. Anketiranci Ankice Petrovič trdijo, da izvajanje *gange* zahteva odlične vokalne sposobnosti, primerljive z ostalimi pomembnimi veščinami, kot sta ples in igranje.

Terenske raziskave za knjigo so obrodile tehtno »zbirko« avdio podatkov. Posnete pesmi *gange* so bile sicer transkribirane v zahodnoevropsko notacijo, toda posnetki kot temeljni značilnosti tega glasbenega žanra izpostavljajo majhne intervale in netemperirani sistem uglasitve (mikrotonalnost). V nasprotju z običajnimi metodami zbiranja pesmi in transkribiranja v tistem času je Petrovičeva preučevala tudi način poučevanja pesmi, družbeno ozadje glasbenega izvajanja ter uporabo in funkcijo *gange* in drugih starih pevskih slogov nasploh. Prav tako so jo zanimali procesi, ki *gango* spreminjajo

1 Anne-Florence Borneuf, »Plaisir partagé et frissons individuels. Chanter et écouter les chants ganga (Croatie/Bosnie-Herzégovine)«, *Cahiers d'Ethnomusicologie* 23 (2010): 73–84. Dostop 14. 3. 2018, <http://ethnomusicologie.revues.org/971>; Dieter Christensen, »Agents of change: Musical practices in a village of the Hercegovina, 1957–1974«, Velika Stojkova, ur., *Proceedings: First Symposium of the ICTM Study Group for Music and Dance in Southeastern Europe* (Skopje: COKOM, 2008), 89–101; Joško Čaleta, »Trends and Processes in the Music Culture of the Dalmatian Hinterland«, v *Music & Anthropology: Journal of Musical Anthropology of the Mediterranean* 6 (2001) dostopano 14. marec 2018, https://www.umbc.edu/MA/index/number6/caleta/jos_0.htm in »Ganga party, *Let iznad gangina gnizda* iliti multimedijsko predstavljanje (ne)odbačene tradicije«, *Kazalište* 12/39–40 (2009): 134–43. Dostop 14. 3. 2018, https://www.umbc.edu/MA/index/number6/caleta/jos_0.htm.

in prilagajajo v družbenopolitičnih in specifičnih kulturnih okoljih, pri čemer je lahko razločila različne sloge *gange*. V tem procesu je izpostavila tako kakovosti lokalnega prenosa znanja kot tudi dragocene »starejše« elemente žanrov, ki so bili predhodniki *gange*. Po drugi strani je avtoričin analitični fokus usmerjen na glasbeno-slogovne značilnosti *gange* in njena monografija je vzorčna etnomuzikološka študija, in sicer v smislu združevanja glasbenih, kulturnih in antropoloških pristopov, saj upošteva tako glasbene kot kulturne vidike *gange*. Transkribirani korpus pesmi je razdeljen na podlagi regionalne geografije, kakor so jo ohranili prebivalci glede na posebne slogovne značilnosti različnih vrst *gange*. Subkulturne besedilne in glasbene značilnosti niso predstavljene znotraj ustaljenih glasbenih norm, ampak so opredeljene skozi oči izvajalcev in občinstva. Petrovičeva uporablja terminologijo lokalnih skupnosti, ki jih je preučevala – to je glasbeni svet, v katerem je »glasba« (kot koncept) opisana s petjem, igranjem, plesom in s pomočjo različnih interaktivnih situacij med samim petjem, v katerih se glasbeni akterji med seboj sporazumevajo z določenimi dejavnostmi, kot so »goniti«, »jecati«, »spuštati«, »dizati« itd. Z ozirom na terminologijo se avtorica izogiba izraza »glasba«, saj ta označuje umetnost organiziranja zvoka po načelih Zahoda, njen razširjeni terminološki vokabular pa želi nadalje razširiti koncept glasbene izkušnje.

Razlike v izgovorjavi pri petju, do katerih pride med različnimi etničnimi skupinami v regiji, so razumljene kot različice, ki imajo skupen izvor, čeprav sestavni deli pripadajo različnim etničnim skupinam. Avtoričin demokratični nazor glede *gange*, ki naj bi bila enakopravna glasbena stvaritev vseh, ki živijo na tem območju, kot tudi njeno poudarjanje nacionalističnih vidikov petja *gange* pri Hrvatih med domovinsko vojno, so prispevali k negativni recepciji njenega raziskovalnega dela o tem glasbenem žanru. V tem pogledu se zgodovina ponavlja: podobna usoda je doletela enega zgodnejših preučevalcev *gange*, Branka Marića, katoliškega duhovnika, ki je emigriral iz Bosne in Hercegovine po drugi svetovni vojni in čigar delo v socialistični Jugoslaviji ni bilo nikoli priznано zaradi njegove politične neprimernosti.

Če povzamem, velja poudariti, da Petrovičeva opredeli nekatere skupne značilnosti, ki zaznamujejo ta nenavadni slog, in sicer strukturo vzorcev *gange* in principe organizacije. Ker gre pri tej glasbi za ustno tradicijo, za nezapisano kulturno dejavnost, to pomeni, da izvajanje terja veliko zbranosti, kar obenem dokazuje, da se posamezniki sloga učijo od drugih članov istega družbenokulturnega okolja. Dejstvo, da večina avtoričinih rezultatov v veliki meri temelji na izsledkih 70. in 80. let prejšnjega stoletja, študiji v bistvu dodatno vrednost, saj popisuje preteklost, ki bi sicer ostala nedokumentirana. V tem smislu lahko knjiga služi kot zgled za mlajše generacije etnomuzikologov, ki – vsaj kar se tiče današnje Hrvaške – sicer večinoma prezrejo dragocene pretekle pristope zbiranja pesmi, transkripcije in analize, ustaljene pred zadnjim desetletjem prejšnjega stoletja. Ta primer bi lahko celo pripomogel k temu, da bi se predstavili in okrepili vpogledi s področja kulturne antropologije: kakor je bila monografija Ankice Petrović pred štiridesetimi leti zastavljena s tezo, ki se je uprla »primitivnim« pogledom na *gango* in dinarske skupnosti, tako še danes na podoben način nasprotuje današnjim prizadevanjem, da se s pomočjo *gange* začrtavajo etnične in nacionalne meje. Vsi ti dejavniki pričajo o pomembnosti tako znanstvenega kot tudi širšega družbenega prispevka tega dela. Po drugi strani je največja šibkost knjige ta, da ji primanjkuje informacij o spreminjajočih se glasbenih in

slogovnih značilnostih ter referenc o sodobnem razumevanju *gange*, še zlasti ključnih za mlajše generacije raziskovalcev.

Za zaključek naj dodam: kot je Petrovićeva pred štiridesetimi leti uporabila svojo disertacijo zato, da je pod vprašaj postavila primitivnost, pripisano *gangi* in skupnostim, ki so to dediščino ohranjale, tako še danes kljubuje sodobnim poskusom, da bi z *gango* začrtavali etnične in nacionalne meje. Kot tako delo ni samo rezultat pomembnih znanstvenih izsledkov, temveč ponuja tudi širši vpogled v kulturo in družbo. Obenem pa – kar je morda še bolj pomembno – po vzoru tega, kako je delo uvedlo in razširilo področje kulturne antropologije pred štiridesetimi leti, tudi danes v podobnem duhu opominja mlajše raziskovalce, kako nujna je »prizemljitev« dela v glasbenem raziskovanju. Knjigo tako priporočam študentom glasbenih ved, še posebej etnomuzikologom, ki bodo v njej našli temeljno študijo o specifičnem glasbenem ustvarjanju *gange*, kot tudi širšemu bralstvu in vsem, ki so povezani z dinarsko regijo, slovečo po svoji *gangi*.

Joško Čaleta
Inštitut za etnologijo in raziskovanje folklore, Zagreb

Ankica Petrović

The Art of Ganga Singing: Cultural Tradition of the Dinaric Area

Ankica Petrović. *Umjetnost pjevanja gange: kulturna tradicija Dinarske zone* [The Art of Ganga Singing: Cultural Tradition of the Dinaric Area]. Livno, Zagreb and Sarajevo: Franjevački muzej i galerija Gorica and Synopsis, 2018. 288 pages + CD-ROM. 23 €. ISBN: 978-9958-01-060-6 (Synopsis, Sarajevo) 978-953-7968-54-0 (Synopsis, Zagreb) 978-9926-8173-1-2 (Franjevački muzej i galerija Gorica).

Ganga, currently the most popular traditional vocal genre of the Dinaric area (stretching across Croatia and Bosnia and Herzegovina), is one of the last examples of the archaic style of music making, entirely different from traditional styles and genres based on the heritage of Western European music, such as “klapa” singing. This style of traditional music making serves as an important identification marker of Dinaric communities in Southeastern Europe, both past and present. The author of the proposed book, the Sarajevo ethnomusicologist Ankica Petrović, remains the greatest proponent of the *ganga* music phenomenon in scholarly circles outside former Yugoslavia.

Petrović’s book is based on her fieldwork research undertaken in the early 1970s, which resulted in her doctoral thesis awarded in 1977, at Queen’s University Belfast. This was the first comprehensive study to analyze *ganga* as a leading genre in the context of other traditional music genres in the Dinaric area – a cultural practice that simultaneously reflects and shapes local, regional, gender and ethnic identifications. The author points out that her choice of topic was a challenge in itself, given that, in Petrović’s own words, there was an expectation that she would choose a less “primitive” form of music than *ganga*, but also that she wanted to confront those very perceptions in the society in which she worked (Petrović 2018, 13). The influence of her mentor, John Blacking, expanded her views on traditional music, and specifically cultural and anthropological approaches to “*ganga* as culture,” along with its overarching structural and performance characteristics – a line of thought that was a novelty in Yugoslav ethnomusicology in the 1970s, and that remains relevant today. Petrović has also embraced a new theoretical-methodological approach concerned with the meaning and function of music in society, the concepts and practices of “tradition bearers,” the dynamics of gender, ethnic and regional identifications, and consideration of music practice in the real contexts of its performance – not on stage but as part of everyday life.

The book comprises five substantial chapters – “*Ganga* in Time and Society,” “Processes of Studying *ganga*,” “Transcriptions of Musical Examples,” “Music Style Analysis” and “Aesthetic Evaluation of *ganga*” – framed by a preface, introduction and conclusion. The book also includes a CD with thirty-five fieldwork recordings of *ganga*,

which according to Petrović are of poor quality due to multiple dubbing and storage on various inadequate media, circumstances beyond her control.

Petrović's starting premise is that the basic characteristics of the structure of the traditional song and dance/musical style cannot be analyzed without addressing the social and cultural relations in which they are created. Ahead of its time yet still relevant today, Petrović's pioneering approach places *ganga* alongside contemporary genres as an important factor in the formation of local musical cultures, and her cultural-anthropological approach to ethnomusicological research remains current today. What is lacking in her study, however, is a better insight into the contemporary scholarly context, given that there have been numerous changes in the understanding of the concept of *ganga*, its musical style and its new roles and functions compared to the 1970s, when the author carried out her research. In this sense the book would benefit from engaging with the work by other, more recent scholars in the field.¹

Describing *ganga*, Petrović observes that it is a musical phenomenon that invokes either completely agreeable or utterly unpleasant reactions: for urban individuals *ganga* is crude and unbalanced, closer to shouting or crying. She argues that amongst the urban population there is a belief that this music is "primitive" and should be replaced by other more acceptable musical forms, such as *bećarac*. Yet despite such opinions, *ganga* remains an authentic and prominent musical expression that not only continues to be a part of regional musical vocabulary, but has also made inroads into the urban environments, which reinforces the social component of *ganga* as musical communication among members of the same community, and specifically between rural and urban layers of society. *Ganga* functions as leisure-time musical activity, regarded as the most beautiful compared to other songs such as *bećarac*, *sevdalinke* and "singing over the bass" (*pjevanje na bas*), especially according to the younger and middle-aged generation of *ganga* performers. Petrović's informants claim that performing *ganga* requires great vocal skills, comparable with other important skills, such as dancing and playing.

The fieldwork for this book resulted in the substantial collecting of audio data. The recorded *gangas* were transcribed in Western European notation, though the recording emphasizes narrow intervals and the untempered system (microtonality) as a fundamental feature of this music genre. In contrast to the usual method of song collecting and transcription common at that time, Petrović also studied how the songs are taught, the social background of musical performance, the use and function of *ganga* and other ancient singing styles in general. She was also interested in processes that modify and adapt *ganga* in the socio-political and specific cultural environments, recognizing different *ganga* styles – a process through which she highlighted the qualities of local knowledge transfer, as well as the valuable "older" musical elements of genres

1 Anne-Florence Borneuf, "Plaisir partagé et frissons individuels: Chanter et écouter les chants *ganga* (Croatie / Bosnie-Herzégovine)," *Cahiers d'Ethnomusicologie* 23 (2010), 73–84 (accessed March 14, 2018, <http://ethnomusicologie.revues.org/971>); Dieter Christensen, "Agents of change: Musical practices in a village of the Hercegovina, 1957–1974," in Velika Stojkova, ed., *Proceedings: First Symposium of the ICTM Study Group for Music and Dance in Southeastern Europe* (Skopje: COKOM, 2008), 89–101; Joško Čaleta, "Trends and Processes in the Music Culture of the Dalmatian Hinterland", *Music & Anthropology: Journal of Musical Anthropology of the Mediterranean* 6 (2001) accessed March 14, 2018, https://www.umbc.edu/MA/index/number6/caleta/jos_0.htm, and "Ganga party, Let iznad gangina gnizda iliti multimedijalno predstavljanje (ne)odbačene tradicije", *Kazalište* 12/39–40 (2009), 134–43.

that were precursors to *ganga*. On the other hand, the author's analytical focus is on the musical-stylistic features of *ganga*, and her monograph is an exemplary ethnomusicological study in the sense that it blends musical, cultural and anthropological approaches, namely the consideration of musical and cultural aspects of the *ganga*. The transcribed corpus of songs was divided according to a regional-geographic basis, preserved by the inhabitants according to special stylistic characteristics of the given *ganga*s. The subcultural textual and musical characteristics are not conceived within established musical norms, but defined by the performers and the audience. Petrović uses the terminology of the local communities that she studies, a musical world in which "music" (as a concept) is described through singing, playing, dancing and various interactive situations during singing, in which musical actors communicate through specific actions, such as "goniti", "jecati", "spuštati", "dizati", etc. In terms of terminology, Petrović avoids the word music, which defines the art of organized sound in the Western world, and her extended terminological vocabulary further extends the concept of *ganga* musical experience.

Pronounced differences in singing, which emerge between different ethnic groups in the region, are seen as variants that have the same origins, although comprising elements pertaining to different ethnic groups. Her democratic attitude towards *ganga*, as the equal musical creation of all the people who live in this region, as well as her emphasis on the war-time nationalistic aspect of singing *ganga* by Croats during the Homeland War, have contributed to the negative reception of Petrović's research on *ganga*. In this sense, history is repeating itself: a similar fate followed the earlier *ganga* scholar Branko Marić, a Catholic priest who emigrated from Herzegovina after the Second World War, and whose work was never acknowledged in Socialist Yugoslavia due to his political unsuitability.

In summary, Petrović recognises some of the common characteristics that mark the conspicuous *ganga* style, namely the structure of *ganga* patterns and the principles of the organization. Given that this music is an oral tradition, an unwritten cultural activity, it means that a great concentration is needed in performance, which at the same time is proof that it is learned from others in the same socio-cultural environment. The fact that Petrović's analysis was largely based on insights gained during her fieldwork research during the 1970s and 1980s actually adds value to this study, testifying to a past that would otherwise be undocumented. In that sense, this book can serve as an example to younger generations of ethnomusicologists who, as far as the Croatian environment is concerned today, largely ignore the valuable earlier approaches of song collecting, transcription and analysis, as was common practice before the 1990s. This example could, in turn, serve to introduce and promote insights from the field of cultural anthropology: as Petrović's monograph was compiled forty years ago, with a thesis that opposed the "primitive" association of the *ganga* and Dinaric communities, it similarly contests modern-day views about drawing ethnic and national boundaries through *ganga*. All these factors attest to the importance of both the scientific and wider social contribution of this work. The main weakness of this study, however, is the lack of information about changing musical and stylistic characteristics, as well as the absence of reference to the contemporary understanding of *ganga*, especially pertinent for new generations of scholars.

To conclude, just as Petrović forty years ago used her dissertation to contest the notion of primitiveness associated with *ganga* and the communities who upheld this heritage, with her book today she counters contemporary attempts to draw ethnic and national boundaries through *ganga*. As such, this work offers not only an important scientific but a wider socio-cultural contribution. In addition, and perhaps more importantly, just as this work introduced and broadened the field of cultural anthropology forty years ago, today it similarly reminds younger scholars about the necessity of grounding their research in musical enquiry. I therefore recommend this book to music students, especially those of ethnomusicology, who will find a foundational study about music-making specific to *ganga*, as well as a wider readership who are connected to the Dinaric region famous for *ganga*.

Joško Čaleta
Institute of Ethnology and Folklore Research, Zagreb