

# **ACTA HISTRIAE** 30, 2022, 2



UDK/UDC 94(05)

ACTA HISTRIAE 30, 2022, 2, pp. 263-564

ISSN 1318-0185

UDK/UDC 94(05) ISSN 1318-0185 e-ISSN 2591-1767



Zgodovinsko društvo za južno Primorsko - Koper Società storica del Litorale - Capodistria

## **ACTA HISTRIAE** 30, 2022, 2

ISSN 1318-0185 e-ISSN 2591-1767 UDK/UDC 94(05)

Letnik 30, leto 2022, številka 2

Odgovorni urednik/ Direttore responsabile/ Editor in Chief:

Darko Darovec

Uredniški odbor/ Comitato di redazione/ Board of Editors:

Gorazd Bajc, Furio Bianco (IT), Stuart Carroll (UK), Angel Casals Martinez (ES), Alessandro Casellato (IT), Flavij Bonin, Dragica Čeč, Lovorka Čoralić (HR), Darko Darovec, Lucien Faggion (FR), Marco Fincardi (IT), Darko Friš, Aleš Maver, Borut Klabjan, John Martin (USA), Robert Matijašić (HR), Darja Mihelič, Edward Muir (USA), Žiga Oman, Jože Pirjevec, Egon Pelikan, Luciano Pezzolo (IT), Claudio Povolo (IT), Marijan Premović (MNE), Luca Rossetto (IT), Vida Rožac Darovec, Andrej Studen, Marta Verginella, Salvator Žitko

Uredniki/Redattori/

Editors:

Urška Lampe, Gorazd Bajc, Lara Petra Skela, Marjan Horvat, Žiga Oman

Prevodi/Traduzioni/ Translations:

Petra Berlot

I aktorii/Sunamisiana/

Lektorji/Supervisione/ Language Editors:

Urška Lampe (angl., slo.), Gorazd Bajc (it.), Lara Petra Skela (angl., slo.)

Izdajatelja/Editori/ Published by:

Zgodovinsko društvo za južno Primorsko - Koper / Società storica del Litorale - Capodistria<sup>®</sup> / Inštitut IRRIS za raziskave, razvoj in strategije družbe, kulture in okolja / Institute IRRIS for Research, Development and Strategies of Society, Culture and Environment / Istituto IRRIS

di ricerca, sviluppo e strategie della società, cultura e ambiente<sup>©</sup>

Sedež/Sede/Address:

Zgodovinsko društvo za južno Primorsko, SI-6000, Koper-Capodistria, Garibaldijeva

18 / Via Garibaldi 18, e-mail: actahistriae@gmail.com; https://zdjp.si/

Tisk/Stampa/Print:

Založništvo PADRE d.o.o. 300 izvodov/copie/copies

Naklada/Tiratura/Copies: Finančna podpora/

Supporto finanziario/ Financially supported by:

Javna agencija za raziskovalno dejavnost Republike Slovenije / Slovenian Research Agency, Mestna občina Koper

Slika na naslovnici/ Foto di copertina/ Picture on the cover:

Dvoboj med Charlesom de Lamethom in Charlesom de Castriesom 12. oktobra 1790. Jean-François Janinet (1752-1814) (Muzej Carnavalet, Pariz) / Duel between Charles de Lameth and Charles de Castries on October 12 1790. Jean-François Janinet (1752-1814) (Carnavalet Museum, Paris) / Duello tra Charles de Lameth e Charles de Castries del 12 ottobre 1790. Jean-François Janinet (1752-1814) (Museo Carnavalet, Parigi).

Redakcija te številke je bila zaključena 30. junija 2022.

Revija Acta Histriae je vključena v naslednje podatkovne baze / Gli articoli pubblicati in questa rivista sono inclusi nei seguenti indici di citazione / Articles appearing in this journal are abstracted and indexed in: CLARIVATE ANALYTICS (USA): Social Sciences Citation Index (SSCI), Social Sciences, Arts and Humanities Citation Index (A&HCI), Journal Citation Reports / Social Sciences Edition (USA); IBZ, Internationale Bibliographie der Zeitschriftenliteratur (GER); International Bibliography of the Social Sciences (IBSS) (UK); Referativnyi Zhumal Viniti (RUS); European Reference Index for the Humanities and Social Sciences (ERIH PLUS); Elsevier B. V.: SCOPUS (NL); DOAJ.

To delo je objavljeno pod licenco / Quest'opera è distribuita con Licenza / This work is licensed under a Creative Commons BY-NC 4.0.

Navodila avtorjem in vsi članki v barvni verziji so prosto dostopni na spletni strani: https://zdjp.si.

Le norme redazionali e tutti gli articoli nella versione a colori sono disponibili gratuitamente sul sito: https://zdjp.si/it/.

The submission guidelines and all articles are freely available in color via website http: https://zdjp.si/en/.

(c) (1)(S)



UDK/UDC 94(05) Volume 30, Koper 2022, issue 2 ISSN 1318-0185 e-ISSN 2591-1767

#### VSEBINA / INDICE GENERALE / CONTENTS

Matjaž Grahornik: Tragičen vstop v novo leto:

smrt Franca Jožefa grofa Herbersteina v dvoboju 2. januarja 1713
Alessandro Fausti: Relazioni di amicizia tra Salò e Venezia.  Il caso della riedizione degli statuti della Magnifica Patria
Prijateljski odnosi med Salòjem in Benetkami. Primer nove izdaje statutov »Magnifice Patrie«
Marija V. Kocić & Nikola R. Samardžić: British Sources on the Crisis of the Venetian Patriciate during the Second Morea War: The Case of Daniel IV Dolphin
Jelena Knežević & Julian Köck: Theodor Mommsen in  Montenegro (1862)
Milena Kavarić & Rajka Đoković: Čedomorstvo u modernoj i suvremenoj Crnoj Gori

Ivona Jovanović & Jasna Potočnik Topler: The Contribution of	
First Teachers of French at Petrovic's Court to the Transformation	407
of Society and the Affirmation of Montenegro in Europe	407
Il contributo dei primi insegnanti di francese alla	
corte dei Petrović alla trasformazione della società e	
l'affermazione del Montenegro in Europa	
Prispevek prvih učiteljev francoščine na Petrovićevem dvoru	
k preobrazbi družbe in uveljavitvi Črne gore v Evropi	
Ivan Jeličić: I migliori elementi d'italianità.	
Local Political Power Ascension and Italianization during the	
First Years of Post-world War I in Volosca-Abbazia, 1918-1920	429
I migliori elementi d'italianità. L'ascesa al potere	
locale e l'italianizzazione nei primi anni del primo	
dopoguerra a Volosca–Abbazia, 1918–1920	
I migliori elementi d'italianità. Vzpon lokalne politične moči	
in italijanizacija v prvih letih po prvi svetovni vojni v	
Volosko–Opatiji, 1918–1920	
Marko Medved: L'abuso della religione nella liturgia politica della	
Fiume dannunziana: la benedizione del pugnale nella chiesa di S. Vito	451
Abuse of Religion in the Political Liturgy of D'Annunzio's	
Rijeka (Fiume): The Scandal of the Blessing of the	
Dagger in St. Vitus Church	
Zloraba vere v politični liturgiji na dannunzijevski Reki:	
blagoslov bodala v cerkvi sv. Vida	
Larysa Poliakova & Natalia Shkoda: Historiographic Issues Regarding	
the Position of the Orthodox and Roman Catholic Churches in	
Soviet Ukraine in the Years 1920–1930	471
Problemi storiografici relativi alle posizioni della chiesa ortodossa	
e quella cattolica romana nell'Ucraina sovietica negli anni 1920–1930	
Historiografska vprašanja glede položaja pravoslavne in	
rimokatoliške cerkve v sovjetski Ukrajini v letih 1920–1930	
Klemen Kocjančič: A Contribution to the Role of (Former)	
Red Army Prisoners of War and White Emigrés in Slovenia	
during the German Occupation, 1943–1945	487
Contributo riguardo al ruolo degli (ex) prigionieri di guerra	
dell'Armata rossa e dell'«emigrazione bianca» in Slovenia	
durante l'occupazione tedesca, 1943–1945	
Prispevek k vlogi (nekdanjih) rdečearmijskih vojnih ujetnikov in belih	
emigrantov v Sloveniji med nemško okupacijo, 1943–1945	

#### ACTA HISTRIAE • 30 • 2022 • 2

Borut Klabjan: Graditi partizanski spomin v socialistični Jugoslaviji:	
slovenski primer v času po drugi svetovni vojni	3
Costruire la memoria partigiana nella Jugoslavia socialista:	
il caso sloveno dopo la seconda guerra mondiale	
Building Partisan Memory in Socialist Yugoslavia:	
The Slovene Case after World War II	
Boštjan Udovič: "Danke Deutschland!": The Political and Diplomatic	
Contribution of the Federal Republic of Germany to the	
Creation of Independent Slovenia	5
«Danke Deutschland!»: il contributo politico-diplomatico	
della Repubblica Federale di Germania alla nascita dello	
Stato indipendente della Slovenia	
»Danke Deutschland!«: politično-diplomatski	
prispevek Zvezne republike Nemčije k nastanku slovenske države	

Received: 2021-04-05 DOI 10.19233/AH.2022.20

### HISTORIOGRAPHIC ISSUES REGARDING THE POSITION OF THE ORTHODOX AND ROMAN CATHOLIC CHURCHES IN SOVIET UKRAINE IN THE YEARS 1920–1930

#### Larysa POLIAKOVA

Bogdan Khmelnitsky Melitopol State Pedagogical University, Melitopol, Ukraine 72312 Getmanska str. 20 e-mail: klioist@ukr.net

#### Natalia SHKODA

Bogdan Khmelnitsky Melitopol State Pedagogical University, Melitopol, Ukraine 72312 Getmanska str. 20 e-mail: igor.schckoda@yandex.ua

#### **ABSTRACT**

The aim of this article is to identify the features of the researchers' approach to the study of the history of the Orthodox and Roman Catholic clergy in the 1920s and 1930s in Soviet Ukraine. Methodological tools of the research cover a set of basic research methods: historiographical analysis, synthesis, typology of scientific areas, comparative analysis and more. The novelty of the study is that from a new point of view highlights the importance of Christian denominations in the modern socio-political process, clarifies the social status of Orthodox and Roman Catholic clergy in Ukraine in 1920-30's, On the basis of the historiographical analysis of the available literature on this problem, it can be stated that this issue from the 1920s to the present day has been more or less analyzed by historians. There are some achievements in the study of this issue. In modern historiography, the study of the history of Christian denominations is one of the priority scientific areas. Despite the politicization of the works of Soviet authors of the second half of the 20th century, they thoroughly analyzed the development of Orthodoxy and Catholicism in the Russian Empire and on the territory of the USSR, studied the relations of these churches with the tsarist government, and later with the Soviet authorities. However, there are still a number of issues that need to be improved. The perspective of further developments can be the study of church bibliography, ethno-confessional composition of churches, inter-confessional relations, regional studies, documentary studies.

Keywords: clergy, religion, Ukraine, spiritual values, Christian denominations

#### PROBLEMI STORIOGRAFICI RELATIVI ALLE POSIZIONI DELLA CHIESA ORTODOSSA E QUELLA CATTOLICA ROMANA NELL'UCRAINA SOVIETICA NEGLI ANNI 1920–1930

#### SINTESI

L'obiettivo dell'articolo è identificare le caratteristiche negli approcci dei ricercatori allo studio della storia del clero ortodosso e cattolico romano nell'Ucraina sovietica negli anni Venti e Trenta. Gli strumenti metodologici della ricerca coprono un insieme di metodi di ricerca di base: analisi storiografica, sintesi, tipologia delle aree scientifiche, analisi comparativa e altro. La novità dello studio è che da un nuovo punto di vista mette in evidenza l'importanza delle denominazioni cristiane nel moderno processo socio-politico e chiarisce lo status sociale del clero ortodosso e cattolico romano in Ucraina nel periodo 1920-1930. Sulla base dell'analisi storiografica della letteratura disponibile sulla questione, si può affermare che questo tema dagli anni Venti ad oggi è stato più o meno analizzato dagli storici. Possiamo notare alcuni progressi nello studio di questo problema. Nella storiografia contemporanea, lo studio della storia delle confessioni cristiane è una delle aree scientifiche prioritarie. Nonostante la politicizzazione nelle opere degli autori sovietici della seconda metà del XX secolo, venne analizzato a fondo lo sviluppo dell'ortodossia e del cattolicesimo nell'Impero russo e sul territorio dell'Unione Sovietica, come pure venivano studiate le relazioni di queste chiese con il governo zarista, e poi con le autorità sovietiche. Tuttavia, ci sono ancora una serie di questioni che devono essere approfondite. In prospettiva gli ulteriori sviluppi potrebbero essere lo studio della bibliografia ecclesiastica, la composizione etno-confessionale delle chiese, le relazioni interconfessionali, gli studi regionali e gli studi documentari.

Parole chiave: clero, religione, Ucraina, valori spirituali, confessioni cristiane

#### INTRODUCTION

The importance of the religious factor in the modern life of Ukraine determines the increased interest of researchers in religious studies. The influence of the church and the clergy on society attracts the constant attention of historians. Domestic scholars are rethinking the role of Christian denominations in national history.

The church history of the first post-revolutionary decades, which is similar to modern religious life in terms of richness and dynamism, attracts special attention. The importance of Christian denominations in the modern socio-political process reinforces the need to clarify the social status of the Orthodox and Roman Catholic clergy in Ukraine in the 1920–1930s. That was the period of the establishment of a new political system and the transformation of traditional spiritual values.

The study of the situation of the Orthodox and Roman Catholic churches is socially important. The current religious situation in the country brings to the fore the problem of eliminating conflicts between adherents of different denominations. The nature of many contradictions should be sought in the actions of the Christian clergy in the 1920s-1930s.

Given these trends, the historiographical work of scholars who analyze various aspects of the situation of the Orthodox and Roman Catholic clergy in the 20's and 30's of the XX century becomes relevant. on the territory of Soviet Ukraine.

#### DISCUSSION

The purpose of this article is to identify the features of the approach of researchers to the study of the history of the Orthodox and Roman Catholic clergy on the territory of Soviet Ukraine in the 1920s–1930s. Orthodoxy and Catholicism were the most numerous Christian denominations in Soviet Ukraine during this period.

Literature on this issue, in which to some extent the authors reveal the history of Orthodox denominations and the Roman Catholic Church, can be divided according to the problem-chronological principle into 2 blocks:

- 1) research of the Soviet period (1920s-1980s);
- 2) post-Soviet historiography (1990s the beginning of the XXI century).

Soviet historiography can also be divided into periods. The first stage of Soviet historiography on the problem dates back to the 1920s–1930s. The Soviet government viewed religion as a political rival in the struggle for influence on the human worldview, which logically determined the atheistic orientation of Soviet historiography. The authors of these works were party and state leaders – P. Krasikov (Krasikov, 1970), B. Kandidov (Kandidov, 1930) and others. At this time, some generalizing works appeared, which became an effective means of the government's struggle against religion. One of them is the work of E. Grekulov (Grekulov, 1930).

Authorities emphasized the exploitative role of the church. Therefore, the religious intelligence of that time was openly ideological, politicized, and its authors ignored the objective, scientific analysis of the factual material. The main task of these publications was to affirm the reactionary nature of the church and the clergy.

Despite the rather biased approach to ecclesiastical issues of Soviet intelligence, the research of individual historians of the Marxist school is important for the disclosure of the topic. The authors of some publications characterized important aspects of this problem – the organizational state of Christian denominations, the change of the line of party-state power in relation to them.

The leading topic of historiographical research in the 1920s–1930s on the church was the struggle against the church counterrevolution. Scholars, as true political agitators, analyzed the struggle of the workers, peasants, women, youth, and trade unions against the church's counterrevolutionary activities.

One of the first attempts in Soviet historiography to shed light on the past of religious denominations from the standpoint of Marxism-Leninism was the work of Professor M. Nikolsky "History of the Russian Church" (Nikolsky, 1985, 123), first published in 1931 and republished in 1985. According to the scientist, the state church is "organization of operation" (Nikolsky, 1985, 123). Despite the negative assessment of the religious life of communities, this study is based on a sufficiently representative source base, which is an indisputable advantage of this work.

Thus, the characteristic features of the research of this period – ideology and bias, which made it impossible to develop a problem in the general context of civilization. The accumulation of a rich factual base of the study was positive.

The second stage of Soviet historiography conditionally falls on the 1950s-1980s. Religious intelligence of this period was still based on atheistic doctrine, based on the anti-church policy of the state. It was in the late 1950s that a new anti-religious campaign began, which restored the attention of official historiography to the problems of church history. The main topics remained the state policy towards the church, the history of the mass atheist movement.

Most scholars have unilaterally covered events related to the social position of the clergy. In the works of D. Ostryanin (Ostryanin, 1965), V. Kolobkov (Kolobkov, 1962) the clergy was equated with class enemies, the activity of the clergy was regarded as a counter-revolutionary subversive work against the socialist state. The authors focused on the joint anti-Soviet actions of the clergy and wealthy peasants.

Scholars of this period considered the question of church history mostly in the plane of materialist philosophy. For example, the researcher W. Tancher claimed that the leadership of the Orthodox Church and the vast majority of parish clergy actively supported the counter-revolutionary forces (Tancher, 1979).

At this time, the first special scientific studies on the history of the Roman Catholic Church appeared, among which a special place is occupied by the works of M. Sheinman. M. Sheinman's work «The Vatican and Catholicism in the late XIX – early XX centuries» attracts attention (Sheinman, 1958). Despite the political and ideological color, this work highlights the general picture of the formation of the Catholic faith, the history of the papacy and the Vatican, describes the organizational structure of the church.

Some authors, considering other scientific problems, briefly touched on some aspects of church history in some regions of Ukraine. For example, in the late 1950s, the Soviet researcher E. Druzhinina, studying the process of settlement of Southern Ukraine (Druzhinina, 1959), fragmentarily considered the participation of Catholics. This study is important for reproducing the general historical background on which the development of the Roman Catholic Church in southern Ukraine took place.



Fig.1: Metropolitan Vasyl Lypkivskyi (Wikimedia Commons).

During the 1960s–1980s, criticism of religion gradually became more balanced: a wealth of factual material on the history of the Orthodox Church and the Roman Catholic Church was accumulated. The works of this period are characterized by a certain general orientation and similar stereotypes of assessments. The works of this group include the work of M. Mchedlov «Catholicism» (Mchedlov, 1970).

Thus, despite the politicization of the works of Soviet authors of the second half of the 20 century, they thoroughly analyzed the development of Orthodoxy and Catholicism in the Russian Empire and the USSR, studied the relationship of these churches with the tsarist government and later the Soviet government. These works require critical analysis.

A significant contribution to the study of the history of the Roman Catholic Church was made by the Catholic priest, Bishop of the Diocese of Tiraspol J.A. Kessler (Kessler, 1930). In his History of the Diocese of Tiraspol, he examined in detail the position of the Roman Catholic Church in the Russian Empire and the USSR. J. Kessler was one of the first to refute the thesis of the purely Polish character of the RCC, paid much



Fig. 2: Kherson bishop of the Russian Orthodox Church Prokopiy Titov (Drevo, 2005).

attention to the organizational structure and socio-political activities of the Tiraspol diocese, clarified the sources and causes of national contradictions in the diocese. So he claimed the destructive influence of the Roman Catholic Church. However, despite the rich factual material, the work of J.A. Kessler requires a critical attitude. The author subjectively and emotionally characterizes the activities of the Roman Catholic Church, exaggerating its role in the religious life of the USSR.

Of particular interest for elucidating the peculiarities of the development of religious life in Ukraine in the 1920's and 1930's will be the study of I. Vlasovsky, a prominent Ukrainian church and political figure who worked in exile, «An Essay on the History of the Ukrainian Orthodox Church» (Vlasovsky, 1998). It is important that the author highlights the features of the spiritual life in some regions of Ukraine in this period. Researching the history of the UOC in Volyn, I. Vlasovsky draws parallels with Roman Catholicism. He provides statistics on the number of religious communities, the number of clergy and RCC believers in the region, compares the peculiarities of the situation of churches, analyzes their driving forces.

During the Soviet period, works of a generalizing nature predominated, but periodically, investigations on the history of individual Christian denominations were published. For example, the work of K. Dmytruk, dedicated to the Ukrainian Autocephalous Orthodox Church (Dmitruk, 1977), O. Shishkin – to the renewal movement (Shishkin, 1970). K. Dmytruk in the spirit of militant atheism evaluated the activities of the autocephalous clergy. The author ignored the problem of large-scale repressions against the entire hierarchy of the Ukrainian Autocephalous Orthodox Church, and limited himself to reporting individual arrests of bishops and priests (Dmitruk, 1977).

F. Turchenko's historical works are more informative and objective about the researched problem. For example, the article «Ukrainian Autocephalous», coauthored with O. Ignatusha (Turchenko & Ignatusha, 1989).

#### **RESULTS**

Thus, in the works of 1950–1980, the question of the relationship between the clergy and the authorities dominated. The conceptual basis of all the works was the thesis of the joint counter-revolutionary work of priests and wealthy peasants. Prejudiced for ideological reasons, the influence of the clergy on public opinion was greatly diminished.

The proclamation of Ukraine's independence and the democratization of public life intensified research into the history of the Orthodox and Roman Catholic Churches. The opening of the State political administration (DPU) archives and the People's Commissariat of Internal Affairs (NKVD) funds provided an opportunity for scientists of the new period to correct the mistakes of Soviet historians, to try to comprehensively analyze the situation of the church in the 1920s-1930s. V. Pashchenko (Pashchenko, 1994), A. Zinchenko (Zinchenko, 1993; Zinchenko, 1997), L. Pylyavets (Pilyavets, 1992), and O. Nestulya (Nestulya, 1995) were among the first of the new methodological positions to try to rethink the essence of church-state relations, the role of Christian denominations in society in the period under study. For example, researcher A. Zinchenko, covering the national movement in the church environment, identified the important role of the Ukrainian Autocephalous Orthodox Church in raising the national identity of believers. Considering the processes of development of the autocephalous movement, the researcher pointed to the Russification of the episcopate and the presence in the ranks of even the autocephalous clergy of priests with a low level of national identity. The scientist highlighted the vivid and tragic life of Metropolitan Vasyl Lypkivskyi based on a thorough source base. Showed the determining role of the First Hierarch in the organization and activities of the Ukrainian Orthodox Church (Zinchenko, 1997).

One of the key issues in church history was the problem of the government's organization of political terror against the clergy. S. Bilokin described the mass arrests of the ROC clergy in 1923 in the Kyiv region. In the refer-

ences to the article «Defeat of the Kyiv Diocesan Administration in 1923» the author posted informative biographical data on prominent members of the clergy (Bilokin, 1999).

The involvement of special services in the repressions against the Orthodox and Roman Catholic clergy in the 1920s in Soviet Ukraine was substantiated by the scientist V. Chentsov (Chentsov, 2000). Researcher L. Babenko continued to study the directions and methods of the secret services in relation to the clergy (Babenko, 2005).

Valuable in the study of this problem is «Martyrology of the Orthodox clergy of the former USSR (1918–1954)» (Bachynska & Bachynsky, 2001). The content of this publication consists of information about 351 persons murdered during the Soviet era by priests collected by Lviv researchers K. Bachynska and M. Bachynsky on the basis of published materials and documents from the Sectoral State Archive of Security Service of Ukraine. This martyrology mitigates the lack of information about the priest's affiliation to the denomination and information about the place of residence.

In the post-Soviet era, historians have paid considerable attention to regional aspects of the development of Christian denominations. Researcher A. Zinchenko. At the present stage he began to study the situation of the Orthodox Church in the 1920s–1930s in Podillya. The scientist showed the process of formation of the Ukrainian Autocephalous Orthodox Church and its activities in the region during the 1920s in the conditions of pressure from the authorities and the negative attitude of the Russian Orthodox Church (Zinchenko, 1993).

Scientist V. Pashchenko in the collection «State and Church in Poltava region during the Soviet era» explored various aspects of church life in the Poltava region in 1920s-1930s (Pashchenko, 2002). In particular, V. Pashchenko showed the implementation of a wide and systematic terror against the clergy in the region, pointed out the far-fetched and baseless accusations of the clergy in counter-revolutionary activities.

The merit of the above-mentioned scientist A. Zinchenko is a successful attempt to understand the role of the individual in the context of national-church movements. The author devoted the monograph «Hierarchs of the Ukrainian Church: Metropolitan Mykola Boretsky, Archbishop Konstantin Krotevych, Metropolitan Ivan Pavlovsky» to this problem (Zinchenko, 2003). The author focuses on the life of the public figure, spiritual preacher of the the Ukrainian Autocephalous Orthodox Church – Mykola Boretsky (Zinchenko, 2003). A separate section of A. Zinchenko's monograph was devoted to another rather controversial figure of the Ukrainian Autocephalous Orthodox Church, Archbishop Konstantin Krotevych. The scientist studied the life of Ivan Pavlovsky – Metropolitan of Kharkiv and All Ukraine. The author identified his contribution to the development of Ukrainization of parishes in Cherkasy, Chernihiv and Slobozhanshchyna during the 1920s (Zinchenko, 2003).

The attention of scholars was drawn to the life and work of hierarchs and other Orthodox churches. For example, O. Trygub drew attention to the life of the Kherson bishop of the Russian Orthodox Church Prokopiy Titov (Trigub, 2004).

It should be noted that scholars were interested in the life of some senior church hierarchs. There are no biographies of typical representatives of the parish clergy.

Some scholars have tried to objectively investigate the situation of the regular clergy. For example, V. Pashchenko (Pashchenko, 2002) and O. Nestulya (Nestulya, 1995), studying church-state relations in the context of the analysis of the system of protection of religious monuments, paid attention to the policy of closing monasteries.

Most scholars were primarily interested in the problem of liquidation of monasteries. The question of the fate of monasticism after the closure of monasteries, the place of the regular clergy in the hierarchy of Ukrainian churches and in society was not clarified.

Scholars O. Ignatusha (Ignatusha, 2001), O. Trygub (Trigub, 2004) focused on the study of certain currents of Orthodoxy in southern Ukraine in the 1920s and 1930s.

New approaches have emerged in the most recent domestic historiography and in the coverage of the history of Roman Catholicism in the Ukrainian lands. We note, first of all, the works of L. Gentosh (Gentosh, 1994) and others, in which the main attention is paid to state-church relations. Interest in the problem contributed to the formation of a circle of scientists specializing in the issue,

A significant contribution to the study of the history of Roman Catholics in the USSR was made by the domestic researcher of Polish origin G. Stronsky (Stronsky, 1994). It highlights the role and place of the Roman Catholic Church in the life of Poles in Soviet Ukraine. Thus, in the publication «The Roman Catholic Church in Ukraine in the 1920s–1930s.» The author examines the tragic fate of the clergy and flock of the Roman Catholic Church in Ukraine during the Soviet totalitarianism of the 1920s–1930s, analyzes the stages of the state religious policy towards the Roman Catholic Church of this period, and investigates the methods of Soviet power struggle against the church.

Studies of the history of the Roman Catholic Church in Ukraine at the present stage reach a qualitatively new level – in research institutions there are special units. Thus, the study of the history of Roman Catholicism in Ukraine is one of the areas of research work of the Center for Church Problems and Ethno-Confessional Studies at Kuras Institute of Political and Ethnic Studies of the National Academy of Sciences of Ukraine.

One of the important areas of research work of the Department of Religious Studies of the Institute of Philosophy. G.S. Frying pans of the National Academy of Sciences of Ukraine is the history of the Roman Catholic Church in Ukraine, the problem of ethno- and state-confessional relations. At the initiative of the Institute's staff in Ukraine, an international scientific-practical conference «Ukraine and the Vatican» is held periodically.

Diligent work on the history of ethnic Germans in southern Ukraine (many of whom were Roman Catholics) is carried out by researchers at the Institute of Ukrainian-German Studies at Dnipropetrovsk National University. O. Gonchar. Scientists of the institute, in particular O. Beznosov, L. Bobylova, carried out a number of studies, which covered issues related to the history of the Roman Catholic Church in Ukraine (Beznosov, 2011; Beznosov, 2012; Bobyleva, 1999).

The collective works of domestic scholars, in particular the ten-volume encyclopedic study «History of Religions in Ukraine», became an important achievement of Ukrainian historiography in studying the historical progress of various religious denominations that functioned in our country. The team of authors traces the historical path of Orthodoxy and the Roman Catholic Church in Ukraine (Catholicism, 2001).

A certain contribution to understanding the problem of the relationship between the Roman Catholic Church and government agencies is the work of domestic researcher E. Bystrytskaya. In the monograph «Eastern policy of the Vatican in the context of the Holy See's relations with Russia and the USSR (1878-1964)» she conducts a detailed analysis of the system of Soviet-Vatican relations the 1920s-1930s (Bystritskaya, 2009). E. Bystrytskay's monograph covers not only the legal position of the Roman Catholic Church in this period, but also traces the dependence of the church on changes in the vectors of domestic and foreign policy of the Soviet government. During the 1920s-1930s, the researcher singled out two stages of Soviet-Vatican relations with their inherent characteristic differences, namely: 1921-1929 - a period aimed at the de jure recognition of the USSR as the Apostolic See; 1929-1939 - a period of ideological confrontation, as a result of which the Roman Catholic Church virtually ceased its activities in the USSR. According to the author, Catholicism in general was perceived by the Soviet authorities not only as a bearer of a religious idea, but also as a representative of the Western system of values, which logically affected its fate in the USSR.

A number of researches by N. Rubleva are an important achievement in the study of the history of the Roman Catholic Church in Ukraine. Of interest is her work «Soviet Government's Policy on the Roman Catholic Church in Ukraine» (Rublyova, 1999). The researcher formulates a set of important conclusions – it was with the establishment of the communist regime in Ukraine that the position of the Roman Catholic Church underwent radical changes; the church desperately tried to adapt to qualitatively new adverse social circumstances; The Roman Catholic Church tried to restore its own structure and hierarchy in Ukraine in the form of apostolic administrations, to create illegal seminaries.

G. Nadtoka's scientific publications attract attention (Nadtoka, 1998). In them, the author describes the measures of the Russian autocracy to curb the social and economic freedom of the Roman Catholic Church; submits separate statistical data on the number of religious buildings of the Roman Catholic

Church in Ukraine, their quantitative changes; analyzes the organizational state of the Roman Catholic Church in Ukraine.

Domestic researchers are interested in the formation of ethno-confessional diasporas (German, Polish, Czech, Armenian and others) and ethno-confessional relations in the history of the Roman Catholic Church. This group of researchers includes I. Baluba (Baluba, 1999), J. Boyko (Boyko, 2007), O. Kalakura (Kalakura, 2007; Kalakura, 1997), I. Lisevych (Lisevich, 1997), O. Rublev (Rublev & Reprintsev, 1995) and others. In particular, I. Lisevych covers in detail and analyzes the official cultural and educational policy of the government towards the Polish community, considers the activities of the Roman Catholic Church in the field of creating Polish schools, cultural centers of Ukraine (Lisevich, 1997).

O. Kalakura in his monograph "Poles in ethnopolitical processes in the lands of Ukraine in the XX century" considers the role of the Roman Catholic Church in the history of the Polish community and the dependence of religious life of Poles on public policy. The author emphasizes that the Roman Catholic Church played not only a spiritual but also a political role in the life of the Polish minority, acted as a center for preserving the national identity of Poles, their consolidation (Kalakura, 2007).

A notable phenomenon in the historiography of the problem was the work of V. Yevtukh and B. Chirko "Germans in Ukraine. 1920–1990", which for the first time comprehensively considered the history of the Germans of the Soviet era (Yevtukh & Chirko, 1994). Among domestic researchers, they have the upper hand in processing an array of documentary materials contained in the funds of the central archives of Ukraine, and on their basis – such a component of German history as the place of ethnicity in the plans of the political regime of Bolshevism.

The history of the Czech Roman Catholic community is partially covered in the studies of V. Naulko (Naulko, 1996), Y. Lutsky (Lutsky, 1999), G. Rudnytsky<sup>1</sup> (Krymska svitlytsia, 17.04.1993, 3), P. Markushevsky<sup>2</sup> (Chornomorski novyny, 22.06.1993, 4) and others.

One of the relatively new and promising areas of research on this issue is the issue of interfaith relations in Ukraine. Thus, one of the first studies of relations between different denominations in Ukraine was N. Bulanova's monograph "History of Christian denominations in the Ekaterinoslav region of the last quarter of the XVIII – early XX centuries" (Bulanova, 2007). The researcher notes that the church and religious life of the Roman Catholic community had a national basis. Each community was a self-sufficient world, where the native language, religion and culture were preserved as a sign of self-identification. At the same time, N. Bulanova emphasizes that these factors did not cause obstacles in relations with representatives of other faiths, primarily due to economic and trade activities.

<sup>1</sup> Krymska svitlytsia, 17.04.1993: Rudnytsky, Grigoryi. Tavrian Czechs: Stories of the founding of Bohemian villages in the Crimea and Melitopol region, 3.

<sup>2</sup> Black Sea news, 22.06.1993: Markushevsky, Petro. Black Sea Czechs, 4.

The article by ethno-confessional researcher K. Lyakh «Ethno-confessional composition of German colonists in the South of Ukraine» is valuable for clarifying the nature of the relationship between Catholics and believers of other Christian denominations. The researcher notes that factors of ethnic origin and religious affiliation were an important component of religious life in southern Ukraine, but did not rule out the possibility of open dialogue with representatives of other faiths (Lyah, 2003).

There were a number of works on the history of individual dioceses of the Roman Catholic Church, parishes, church system, features of religious life in different regions of Ukraine. Among them we can note the works of O. Pasechnyk (Pasechnik, 2009), N. Seiko (Seiko, 2005) and others.

A significant contribution to the modern historiography of the problem was made by the Russian researcher O. Licenberger. Thus, in the monograph «The Roman Catholic Church in Russia: History and Legal Status» the researcher conducted a detailed analysis of the historical and legal situation of the Roman Catholic Church in Russia in the 1920s–1930s (Liezenberger, 2001). O. Litzenberger pays special attention to the influence of the Roman Catholic Church from the totalitarian communist regime; reveals the extent of persecution and repression against believers and clergy during the Soviet era. The researcher briefly raises issues related to the position of the Roman Catholic Church in Ukraine.

#### CONCLUSION

Thus, on the basis of the historiographical analysis of the available literature on this problem, it can be stated that this issue has been analyzed by domestic historians to a greater or lesser extent since the 1920s and to this day. There are some achievements in the study of this issue. In modern domestic historiography, the study of the history of Christian denominations is one of the priority scientific areas. The works of modern domestic scholars undoubtedly filled significant gaps in the coverage of the history of Christian denominations, accumulated informative documentary material, but many issues of life of the Orthodox and Roman Catholic clergy within the outlined chronological boundaries are insufficiently studied. Many aspects of the history of Christian denominations in Ukraine in the 1920s–1930s have gone unnoticed by scholars, prompting further research. The prospect of further development of this socially significant topic may be the study of church bibliography, ethno-confessional composition of churches, inter-confessional relations, regional studies, documentaries.

### HISTORIOGRAFSKA VPRAŠANJA GLEDE POLOŽAJA PRAVOSLAVNE IN RIMOKATOLIŠKE CERKVE V SOVJETSKI UKRAJINI V LETIH 1920–1930

#### Larysa POLIAKOVA

Državna pedagoška univerza Bohdan Khmelnytsky Melitopol, Hetmanska 20, 72312 Melitopol, Ukrajina e-mail: klioist@ukr.net

#### Natalia SHKODA

Državna pedagoška univerza Bohdan Khmelnytsky Melitopol, Hetmanska 20, 72312 Melitopol, Ukrajina e-mail: igor.schckoda@yandex.ua

#### **POVZETEK**

Namen članka je ugotoviti značilnosti pristopa raziskovalcev k preučevanju zgodovine pravoslavne in rimskokatoliške duhovščine v 20. in 30. letih 20. stoletja v sovjetski Ukrajini. Pravoslavje in katolicizem sta bili v tem obdobju najštevilčnejši krščanski gibanji v sovjetski Ukrajini. Metodološka raziskovalna orodja vključujejo nabor osnovnih raziskovalnih metod: zgodovinopisna analiza, sinteza, tipologija znanstvenih področij, primerjalna analiza. Novost študije je v tem, da z novega zornega kota osvetljuje pomen krščanskih veroizpovedi v sodobnem družbenopolitičnem procesu ter pojasnjuje družbeni status pravoslavne in rimskokatoliške duhovščine v Ukrajini v dvajsetih in tridesetih letih 20. stoletja, oblikovanje novega političnega sistema in transformacijo tradicionalnih duhovnih vrednot. Na podlagi zgodovinopisne analize razpoložljive literature o tej problematiki lahko sklepamo, da so to problematiko domači zgodovinarji v večji ali manjši meri analizirali že od dvajsetih let prejšnjega stoletja. Dela znanstvenikov so nedvomno zapolnila pomembne vrzeli v zgodovini krščanskih veroizpovedi in zbrala pomembno dokumentarno gradivo. Toda številna vprašanja življenja pravoslavne in rimskokatoliške duhovščine v določenem kronološkem okviru niso bila dovolj raziskana. Najprej gre za vprašanje proučevanja cerkvene bibliografije, etnokonfesionalne sestave cerkva, medkonfesionalnih odnosov, lokalne zgodovine in dokumentarnega filma. Vse našteto odpira možnosti za nadaljnje raziskave.

Ključne besede: duhovščina, vera, Ukrajina, duhovne vrednote, krščanske veroizpovedi

#### SOURCES AND LITERATURE

- **Babenko, Liudmila (2005)**: The Clergy as an Object of Information and Analytical Activities of Special Services in Ukraine (20–30s of the XX century). History of Religions in Ukraine. Scientific Yearbook, 1, 102–106.
- **Bachynska, Kateryna & Michailo Bachynsky (2001)**: Martyrologist of the Orthodox Clergy of the Former USSR (1918–1954). Christmas 2000, 1, 72–89.
- **Baluba, Igor** (1999): Problems of Cultural and Educational Development of the Polish National Minority in Ukraine in the 20s–30s of the XX Century. Posvit, 23, 2, 10–12.
- **Beznosov, Oleksandr (2012)**: Famine of 1932–1933 in German and Mennonite Settlements in the South of Ukraine: Character and Consequences. In: Bobyleva, Svitlana (ed.): Nutrition of Nimetskoi History. Dnipropetrovsk, Dnepropetrovsk National University, 121–137.
- **Beznosov, Oleksandr (2011)**: Germans and Mennonites of Southern Ukraine in the Context of Soviet National Policy. In: Bobyleva, Svitlana (ed.): Questions of German history. Dnepropetrovsk, Dnepropetrovsk National University, 159–173.
- **Bilokin, Sergiy** (**1999**): Defeat of the Kyiv Diocesan Administration in 1923. Kyivska starovina, 1, 90–106.
- **Bobyleva, Svitlana** (1999): Essays on the History of Germans and Mennonites in the South of Ukraine (late 18th–first half of the 19th Century). Dnepropetrovsk, Art Press.
- **Boyko, Yaroslav (2007)**: Placement of Poles in the South of Ukraine (late 19th–early 20th centuries). Poles in the Ukrainian Socialist Republic, 1, 79–85.
- **Bulanova**, **Natalia** (2007): History of Christian Denominations of Ekaterinoslav Region in the Last Quarter of the 18–early 20 Centuries. Dnepropetrovsk, IMA-press.
- **Bystritskaya, Ella (2009)**: Eastern Policy of the Vatican in the Context of the Holy See's Relations with Russia and the USSR (1878–1964): Monograph. Ternopil, Pidruchniki i posibniki.
- **Catholicism (2001):** History of Religion in Ukraine, 4. Kyiv, The World of Knowledge. **Chentsov, Viktor (2000):** Political Repression in Soviet Ukraine. Kiev, Zbruch.
- Chornomorski novyny. Odessa, 1917 –
- **Dmitruk, Klym** (1977): Who Served and are Serving Traitors from the so-called Autocephaly. Kyiv, Znannya.
- **Drevo, 2005** Otkrytaya pravoslavnaya entsiklopediya. https://drevo-info.ru/articles/2565.html (last access: 2022-06-06).
- **Druzhinina, Olena (1959)**: Northern Black Sea Region in 1775–1800. Moscow, Publishing House of the Academy of Sciences of the USSR, Institute of History.
- **Gazeta den, 1996** https://day.kyiv.ua/ru/article/podrobnosti/narodnyy-mitropolit (last access: 2022-06-06).
- **Gentosh, Liliana (1994)**: The Catholic Church and the Formation of Ukrainian Statehood (1917–1923). Second International Congress of Ukrainians: Reports and Announcements. History, 2, 19–22.

- Grekulov, Efim (1930): How the Russian Clergy choked. Moscow, Atheist.
- **Ignatusha, Oleksandr** (2001): Critical Review of the Development of the Synodal Church in the South of Ukraine (1920s–1930s). Archive. Document. History. Modernity. Pratsi derzhavnoho arkhivu Odeskoi oblasti, 4, 214–221.
- **Kalakura**, **Oleg** (2007): Poles in Ethnopolitical Processes in the Lands of Ukraine in the XX century. Kyiv, Knowledge of Ukraine.
- **Kalakura, Oleg (1997)**: The Polish Minority in Ukraine against the Background of the Policy of Militant Atheism 20-30 years of XX century. In: Scientific Notes of the Institute of Political and Ethnonational Studies of the National Academy of Sciences of Ukraine, 2. Kyiv, IPiEND, 64–70.
- **Kandidov, Borys (1930)**: Religious Counter-Revolution and Intervention 1918–1920 (Essays and materials). Moscow, Atheist.
- Kessler, J.A. (1930): Geschichte der Diozese Tiraspol. N. Dakota, Dickinson.
- **Kolobkov, Volodymyr** (1962): The Legacy of Centuries of Darkness. Kyiv, State Publishing House of Political Literature.
- Krasikov, Petr (1970): Selected Atheistic Works. Moscow, Mysl.
- **Krymska svitlytsia**. Simferopol, 1992– http://svitlytsia.crimea.ua/ks\_15\_93.pdf (last access: 2022-07-09).
- **Liezenberger, Olga (2001)**: The Roman Catholic Church in Russia: History and Legal Status. Saratov, Povolzhskaya Academy of Public Service.
- **Lisevich, Ivan (1997)**: Spiritually Thirsty: Spiritual Life of the Polish National Minority in Dnieper Ukraine in 1864–1917. Kyiv, Institute of History of Ukraine, National Academy of Sciences of Ukraine.
- **Lutsky, Yuryi** (1999): Czechs in Ukraine, 1917–1933: The Tragedy of the Owner. Chronicle-2000, 29–30, 119–138.
- **Lyah, Kateryna (2003)**: Ethno-confessional Composition of German Colonists in the South of Ukraine. Germans of the Azov and Black Sea Regions: History and Modernity. Proceedings of the international scientific conference, 1, 97–107.
- Mchedlov, Michail (1970): Catholicism. Moscow, Politizdat.
- **Nadtoka, Genadyi** (**1998**): Interfaith Relations in Ukraine in the early XX century. Ukrainian Historical Journal, 5, 86–99.
- Naulko, Vsevolod (1996): Czechs in Ukraine. In: Vakhnina, Larysa, Mushketyk, Olesiya & Viktoria Yuzvenko (eds.). Under One Sky: Folklore of Ethnic Groups of Ukraine. Kiev, Holovna spets. red. lit-ry movamy nats. menshyn Ukrainy, 171–182.
- **Nestulya,** Oleksyi (**1995**): The Fate of Church Antiquity in Ukraine: 1917–1941. Kyiv, Institute of History of Ukraine, National Academy of Sciences of Ukraine.
- Nikolsky, Nickolay (1985): History of the Russian Church. Moscow, Politizdat.
- **Ostryanin, Dmytro** (1965): Religion and its Reactionary Role. Kyiv, State Publishing House of Political Literature.
- **Pasechnik, Oleg (2009)**: Roman Catholic Church in Kamyanets-Podilsky (Khmelnitsky) region in 1920–1941. Khmelnitsky, Publisher of Private Enterprise Tsyupak A.A.
- **Pashchenko, Volodymyr** (1994): Freedom of Conscience in Ukraine: Myths and Facts of the 20–30's of XX Century. Kiev, Institute of History of Ukraine.

- **Pashchenko, Volodymyr (2002)**: The Policy of the Bolshevik Party on Religious Issues and its Consequences (20–30 years of 20 century). In: Shemet, Petro (ed.): State and Church in Poltava Region during the Soviet era. Poltava, Kobeliaky, 13–37.
- **Pilyavets, Leonid** (1992): Godmother of the DPU. From the History of the Church of Christ. Human and World, 5–6. Kyiv, Presa Ukrainy, 26–29.
- **Rublyova**, **Natalia** (1999): The Policy of the Soviet Government Towards the Roman Catholic Church in Ukraine. Kiev, Znannya.
- **Rublev**, **Oleksandr & Volodymyr Reprintsev** (**1995**): Repressions against Poles in Ukraine in the 1930s. In: Archives of VUCHK-GPU-NKVD-KGB, 1–2. Kyiv, Instytut istorii Ukrainy, 116–156.
- **Seiko, Nataliia** (2005): Charitable Activities of the Catholic Community of the Right Bank in Favor of the Development of Education in the XIX Century. Museum Work in Zhytomyr Region: History, Experience, Problems. "Great Volyn": Proceedings of the Zhytomyr Scientific and Local History Society of Volyn Researchers, 33, 243–249.
- **Sheinman, Michail (1958)**: The Vatican and Catholicism in the late 19th–early 20th Centuries. Moscow, Publishing House of the Academy of Sciences of the USSR.
- **Shishkin, Aleksandr** (1970): The Essence and Critical Assessment of the "Renovationist" Split in the Russian Orthodox Church. Kazan, Kazan University Publishing House.
- **Stronsky, Genrich (1994)**: Doomed to Silence: RCC in Ukraine in the 1920–30's. Man and the World, 3–4, 17.
- **Tancher, Volodymyr (1979)**: Religious Vestiges and their Overcoming. Kiev, Politizdat.
- **Trigub, Aleksandr** (2004): Renovation Bishops 20–30s of 20 Century in Nikolayevshchina. History. Ethnography. Culture. New Researches: 5-th Nikolaev Regional Local Lore Conference, 5, 261–263.
- **Turchenko, Fedir & Ignatusha, Oleksandr (1989)**: Ukrainian Autocephalous. In: Homeland, 12. Kyiv, Radianskyi pysmennyk, 166–175.
- **Vlasovsky, Ivan (1998)**: Essay on the History of the Ukrainian Orthodox Church. Kyiv, Naukova Dumka.
- **Yevtukh, Volodymyr & Bohdan Chirko** (**1994**): Germans in Ukraine (1920–1990). Center for Ethnosociological and Ethnopolitical Studies of the Institute of Sociology of the National Academy of Sciences of Ukraine. Kyiv, Lybid.
- **Zinchenko**, **Arsen** (1993): The Gospel of the National Spirit. Ukrainian Church in Podillya in the First Third of the XX century. Kyiv, Education.
- **Zinchenko, Arsen** (1997): Free Yourself by Faith. Life and Deeds of Metropolitan Vasyl Lypkivsky. Kyiv, Dnipro.
- **Zinchenko**, **Arsen** (2003): Hierarchs of the Ukrainian Church: Metropolitan Mykola Boretsky, Archbishop Konstantin Krotevych, Metropolitan Ivan Pavlovsky. Kyiv, Ukrainian Publishing Union.